Minutes of Meeting of Environment Committee of Mid Ulster District Council held on Tuesday 14 November 2023 in Council Offices, Burn Road, Cookstown and by virtual means

Members Present Councillor Cuthbertson, Chair

Councillors J Burton, J Buchanan, Cahoon, Kelly, Groogan, Mallaghan, McAleer, McElvogue, McGuigan,

McNamee, Milne*, Quinn*, Robinson, Varsani

Officers in Mr McCreesh (Chief Executive)**

Attendance Mrs Campbell, Strategic Director of Environment (SD:

Env)

Mr Lowry, Head of Technical Services (HoTS)

Mr McAdoo, Assistant Director of Environmental Services

(AD: ES)

Mr Scullion, Assistant Director of Property Services (AD:

PS)

Miss Thompson, Committee and Member Services

Officer

Others in Attendance

Councillor F Burton***

Agenda Item 4 - Deputation - Safe Electricity Armagh

and Tyrone (SEAT)

Messrs Lennon and Woods

The meeting commenced at 7.00 pm

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson welcomed everyone to the meeting and those watching the meeting through the Live Broadcast. Councillor Cuthbertson in introducing the meeting detailed the operational arrangements for transacting the business of the committee in the chamber and by virtual means, by referring to Annex A to this minute.

E236/23 Notice of Recording

Members noted that the meeting would be webcast for live and subsequent broadcast on the Council's You Tube site.

^{*} Denotes members and members of the public present in remote attendance

^{**} Denotes Officers present by remote means

^{***} Denotes others present by remote means

E237/23 Apologies

Councillor Martin.

E238/23 Declarations of Interest

The Chair reminded Members of their responsibility with regard to declarations of interest.

E239/23 Deputation - Safe Electricity Armagh and Tyrone (SEAT)

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson welcomed the representatives from SEAT to the meeting and invited them to make their presentation (appendix 1).

Mr Lennon thanked the Committee for the opportunity to raise concerns regarding the planned North-South Interconnector and the impact it will have on the residents of Mid Ulster District Council. Mr Lennon clarified that SEAT are not against interconnection but that the purpose of their attendance tonight was to highlight the main points of concern regarding the proposed infrastructure these being, the case of need, overhead versus underground cabling, cost and compensation and technology. Mr Lennon highlighted that there has never been a full accurate costing of the proposed interconnector and that since 2004 technology has changed massively along with the energy market and that the European approach to building sustainable networks has also changed. Mr Lennon stated that SEAT are asking the Department for Energy for a review to ascertain if the interconnector is still needed and how it meets Northern Ireland's energy strategy.

Mr Woods encouraged Members to seek a review for the need for this interconnector particularly as there are so many unanswered questions.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson commended Messrs Lennon and Woods for their work since 2004 and that he was mindful that a number of Members have not been elected that length of time. Councillor Cuthbertson referred to the information sent to Members prior to the meeting tonight and stated that if there was any further information which could be circulated it would be useful for Members.

Councillor Varsani asked if the concerns regarding the interconnector were to be ranked what the top two concerns would be.

Mr Woods stated that Northern Ireland consumers have come through a number of energy price rises recently and asked why Northern Ireland consumers and industry should continue to have to pay costs which he believed would rocket if the interconnector was put in place. Mr Woods also highlighted concerns of landowners in Northern Ireland receiving such a meagre payment for lands compared to the South whilst destroying the environment and causing risk to health in the process. Mr Woods stated that there was nothing wrong with cross border activity but questioned why people should be allowed to be sucked in to a system which has been so badly managed in the South.

Councillor Robinson referred to costs and poor compensation and asked if there are any health hazards with the overhead cables as opposed to underground cabling.

Mr Lennon stated that the British Medical Journal identified the potential for higher risks of childhood leukaemia for those associated with close proximity to power lines. In addition the World Health Organisation indicate that there are a number of concerns with powerlines that have not been scientifically disproven and that they use the precautionary principle in that if something is uncertain it should not be done and that this is the approach taken to risk in the UK and EU. Mr Lennon stated there was a similar proposal linking Belgium and Germany and when they considered issues similar to those for the proposed North-South interconnector they decided to cable underground. Mr Lennon stated that the biggest factor associated with overhead cabling is overhead emissions and that scientific evidence shows that significant and prolonged exposure to these emissions will cause potential damage.

Councillor Mallaghan referred to the various interconnectors and stated that there is the potential for cheaper electricity coming from nuclear in France and asked if this has been considered.

Mr Lennon advised that the Republic of Ireland have revised their energy strategy in the last five years and this is in reaction to an EU change in technology in networks. It was advised that the EU are now putting in multi purpose interconnectors which use a DC line as opposed to an AC line which is what the North-South interconnector proposes to use. Mr Lennon stated that the EU want to increase the generating capacity and that further transfer of renewable power has been agreed between Ireland and France. Mr Lennon referred to the Moyle interconnector and that there was no reason why it could not be upgraded but that the main constriction relates to contractual terms.

Mr Woods also referred to the Kilmarnock to Kilroot interconnector and that as much renewable energy as is required can be provided from Scotland. Mr Woods also referred to lack of investment in power to the West of Northern Ireland. Mr Woods stated that SEAT have raised approximately £1 million for their work to date from donations and that upcoming tribunals will also require to be funded and questioned why this should have to be the case.

Councillor Robinson referred to the compensation being paid to farmers in the North at £13k per acre as opposed to £100k per acre in the South.

Mr Lennon stated it was his understanding that SONI were in contact with Land and Property Services to work out the average price of agricultural land and that is the figure given. Mr Lennon stated that £13-20k per acre for agricultural land is probably not that inaccurate at the moment but emphasised that landowners are being asked to give up a site which has planning permission and in addition they are being asked to stymie future development if it is within the safe zone of the overhead line. Existing businesses may also be devalued. Mr Lennon stated that SONI do not have the same statutory basis to make compensation payments and that SEAT are lobbying the Department for the Economy and Department for Infrastructure to

replicate the payments being made in the South but that this has not happened due to lack of Assembly.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson thanked the representatives again for their attendance and asked them to keep in touch with Council with further updates.

Mr Woods stated that there are continual developments and that he had put together additional information. The information was circulated to Members (appendix 2).

Messrs Lennon and Woods left the meeting at 7.38 pm.

E240/23 Chair's Business

Councillor McGuigan referred to proposal being brought forward by Workspace to replace a number of trees that were damaged/removed during a NI Water sewerage project a number of years ago. Councillor McGuigan stated that he is a Council representative on Workspace. The Councillor stated that whilst NI Water replaced the trees after the works these trees have not grown and that the contractor has now moved from the site with no follow up. Councillor McGuigan stated that the issue that Workspace have come across is that there are utilities in the area and the question is whether these could be impacted by bringing their project forward. The Councillor stated that Workspace are asking for some assistance from Council as Dfl will not provide the information required to them. Councillor McGuigan highlighted that Workspace are putting money to this project and proposed that officers from Council work with Workspace to assist them in getting the information they require to move forward with their project.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson stated he was surprised that Dfl would not be forthcoming in providing the information required and that he would leave the matter with the Director and officers to make contact with the group.

Councillor Groogan seconded Councillor McGuigan's proposal.

Resolved

That it be recommended to Council that officers make contact with Workspace to assist them in getting the information they require from Dfl to move forward with their project.

Matters for Decision

E241/23 Dfl Roads Proposal to Mid Ulster District Council – No Waiting At Any Time Restriction at Charlemont Street, Moy

Members considered previously circulated report which sought agreement in relation to proposal to introduce no waiting at any time, loading and unloading at Charlemont Street, Moy.

Proposed by Councillor McNamee Seconded by Councillor McElvogue and

Resolved

That it be recommended to Council to endorse the proposal submitted by Department for Infrastructure Roads in relation to proposal to introduce no waiting at any time, loading and unloading at Charlemont Street, Moy.

E242/23 Dfl Roads Proposal to Mid Ulster District Council – Disabled Person's Parking Bay Amendment, Station Road, Clogher

Members considered previously circulated report which sought agreement in relation to proposal to amend Disabled Person's Parking Bay provision at Station Road, Clogher.

Proposed by Councillor McNamee Seconded by Councillor McElvogue and

Resolved

That it be recommended to Council to endorse the proposal submitted by Department for Infrastructure Roads in relation to proposal to amend Disabled Person's Parking Bay provision at Station Road, Clogher.

E243/23 Dfl Roads Proposal to Mid Ulster District Council – Derestriction, Ballygawley Roundabouts

Members considered previously circulated report which sought agreement in relation to proposal to introduce a derestriction of current speed limits at Ballygawley Roundabouts, and main link roads.

Proposed by Councillor McNamee Seconded by Councillor McElvogue and

Resolved

That it be recommended to Council to endorse the proposal submitted by Department for Infrastructure Roads in relation to proposal to introduce a derestriction of current speed limits at Ballygawley Roundabouts, and main link roads.

E244/23 Bus Shelters Update

The Head of Technical Services (HoTS) presented previously circulated report which provided update on current bus shelter status.

Resolved That it be recommended to Council –

- That the following applications move from stage 5 of the process -
 - Mourne Crescent, Coalisland 6nr passengers
 - Annagher Road, Coalisland 15nr passengers
 - Main Road, Moygashel 6nr passengers

- Findermore Road, Clogher 12nr passengers
- That the following applications are approved for installation -
 - Dungannon Road, Cabragh
 - Ballyronan Road, Magherafelt

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson referred to item 21 on the agenda – Rationalisation of Recycling Centres and Grass Cutting Working Group Update and proposed that this item be moved to open business as he felt there was nothing within the report which was sensitive and that in the interests of openness and transparency the item should move to open business.

Councillor McGuigan stated he was not sure the item should be moved into open business as the matter is still at working group stage and that previously the outworkings of working groups have been brought back to Committee under confidential business. The Councillor stated that the job of work of the working group is not complete and that the issue of grass cutting still has to be dealt with and that final costings still have to be provided. Councillor McGuigan proposed that the item be kept in confidential business tonight and that when all information is available it could be brought to Committee in open business.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson stated that the report before Members tonight deals with Recycling Centres and that the other issues such as grass cutting and toilets are still being worked on.

Councillor Robinson seconded Councillor Cuthbertson's proposal as he felt the matter of recycling centres had been worked through as far as possible by the working group.

Councillor McNamee seconded Councillor McGuigan's proposal.

Members voted on Councillor Cuthbertson's proposal –

For – 6 Against - 9

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson stated he felt it was a shame the Committee could not be open and transparent.

Matters for Information

E245/23 Environment Committee minutes of meeting held on 10 October 2023

Members noted minutes of Environment Committee held on 10 October 2023.

E246/23 Best Kept Awards 2023

Members noted previously circulated report which advised of the results of the NI Amenity Council Best Kept Awards 2023.

E247/23 Recycle Week 2023

Members noted previously circulated report which advised of the activities carried out for Recycle Week 2023.

E248/23 Town Centre Footpath Snow/Ice Clearance Agreement

Members noted previously circulated report which outlined the rolling annual winter maintenance agreement with Dfl in relation to the treatment of footpaths in the main town centres within Mid Ulster.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson stated that amendments were made to the Dungannon map some years ago to include Church Lane which runs from Market Square down a steep hill to a Council car park. The Councillor stated that Church Lane is not included in the map provided within the report and asked that it be included again going forward. Councillor Cuthbertson referred to recent meeting in relation to adoption of public realm works in Dungannon and that footpaths in Dungannon Town Centre are Council's responsibility and asked if this has caused any issues for Council ie. does Council still have to wait on a request from Dfl to enact the agreement or because the footpaths are still under Council control that Council can move ahead with clearance without waiting on a request from Dfl.

The Assistant Director of Environmental Services (AD: ES) stated on the first issue he was happy to go back and amend the map. In relation to the second point it was advised that Council still has to wait on Dfl to trigger the agreement and request Council assistance with snow/ice clearance.

The Chair, Councillor Cuthbertson asked if someone slipped on icy footpath was this the responsibility of Council or Dfl.

The AD: ES stated it is a matter for Dfl to trigger the agreement and advised that there were some slips last year which Council forwarded to Dfl for investigation.

E249/23 Tullyvar Joint Committee Update

Members noted previously circulated report which provided an update on the business of the Tullyvar Joint Committee.

Councillor Mallaghan asked if Members would get a presentation or workshop in the future regarding negotiations with the firm who want to acquire three of Council's landfill sites.

The Assistant Director of Environmental Services (AD: ES) advised that the proposal is at a very early stage and will be brought back to Committee in due course for consideration.

Councillor Mallaghan stated he was aware that Tullyvar Joint Committee have been asked for permission to proceed with conversations and given there are two other landfill sites under Council control it would be important that they are given the same consideration.

E250/23 Ulster in Bloom Competition 2023

Members noted previously circulated report which outlined the Translink Ulster in Bloom competition results for 2023.

E251/23 Building Control Workload

Members noted previously circulated report which provided update on the workload analysis for Building Control.

E252/23 Entertainment Licensing Applications

Members noted previously circulated report which provided update on Entertainment Licensing Applications across the Mid Ulster District.

E253/23 Dual Language Signage Surveys

Members noted previously circulated report which advised of the result of surveys undertaken on all applicable residents on the streets/roads in response to Dual Language Signage Nameplate requests.

E254/23 Dual Language Signage Requests

Members noted previously circulated report which advised of requests for Dual Language Signage from residents on the streets/roads in question.

E255/23 Emergency Planning Update

Members noted previously circulated report which provided update with respect to Emergency Planning Mutual Aid Protocols to assist District Councils make arrangements to reduce, control and mitigate the effects on any emergency.

Live broadcast ended at 8.00 pm.

Local Government (NI) Act 2014 - Confidential Business

Proposed by Councillor Varsani Seconded by Councillor McNamee and

Resolved

In accordance with Section 42, Part 1 of Schedule 6 of the Local Government Act (NI) 2014 that Members of the public be asked to withdraw from the meeting whilst Members consider items E256/23 to E264/23.

Matters for Decision

| E256/23 | Rationalisation of Recycling Centres and Grass Cutting |
|---------|--|
| | Working Group Update |
| E257/23 | Councils Fleet Safety Policy Update |
| E258/23 | Lough Neagh/River Blackwater Update |

Matters for Information

| E259/23 | Environment Committee Confidential Minutes of meeting held on 10 October 2023 |
|---------|---|
| E260/23 | Capital Framework – ICT Contracts Update |
| E261/23 | Capital Framework – IST Contracts Update |
| E262/23 | Capital Projects – Scoping Contracts Update |
| E263/23 | Capital Programme 2023-2027: Quarter 2 2023/24 Update |
| E264/23 | Off Street Car Parking: Quarter 2 2023/2024 |

E265/23 Duration of Meeting

The meeting was called for 7.00 pm and ended at 8.33 pm.

| CHAIR | | |
|--------|------|------|
| | | |
| | | |
| DATE _ | | |

Annex A – Introductory Remarks from the Chairperson

Good evening and welcome to the Council's [Policy & Resources/Environment/ Development] Committee in the Chamber, [Dungannon/Magherafelt] and virtually.

I specifically welcome the public watching us through the Live Broadcast. The Live Broadcast will run for the period of our Open Business but will end just before we move into Confidential Business. I let you know before this happens.

Just some housekeeping before we commence. Can I remind you:-

- If you have joined the meeting remotely please keep your audio on mute unless invited to speak and then turn it off when finished speaking
- Keep your video on at all times, unless you have bandwidth or internet connection issues, where you are advised to try turning your video off
- If you wish to speak please raise your hand in the meeting or on screen and keep raised until observed by an Officer or myself
- Should we need to take a vote this evening I will ask each member to confirm whether they are for or against the proposal or abstaining
- When invited to speak please introduce yourself by name to the meeting
- For any member attending remotely, if you declare an interest in an item, please turn off your video and keep your audio on mute for the duration of the item
- If referring to a specific report please reference the report, page or slide being referred to
- Lastly, I remind the public and press that taking photographs of proceedings or using any means to enable anyone not present to see or hear proceedings, or making a simultaneous oral report of the proceedings are not permitted

Thank you and we will now move to the first item on the agenda



Safe Electricity Armagh Tyrone presentation to Environment Committee 10th October 2023

Thank you for giving us this opportunity to raise our grave concerns regarding the planned North-South Interconnector and the impact it will have on residents of Mid Ulster District Council. In addition to our discussion, we want to leave you with our main points of concern regarding this infrastructure.

Overhead vs Underground

Safe Electricity Armagh Tyrone was formed in 2006 to represent residents and landowners concerned with the proposed North-South Interconnector. To date we have the support of c. 6,500 residents backing a campaign to have the proposed interconnector undergrounded. 95% of residents and landowners who would be expected to facilitate one or more pylons for an overhead line have refused and will continue to refuse to sign any easement permission to allow development of the proposed overhead North-South Interconnector to commence.

In 2007 the Systems Operator for Northern Ireland (SONI) said, "we believe an underground cable would not be suitable," yet undergrounding is used throughout Ireland, the UK and the EU.

SEAT is not against the idea of interconnection, but we believe that if interconnection is to happen, the people of Armagh and Tyrone should not be treated as second class citizens being subjected to an overhead interconnector when undergrounded interconnection technology is used elsewhere.

We refer you to Eirgrid's commitment to underground a similar transmission between Kildare and Meath in 2021, stating that it was the best of four options. This Kildare-Meath underground cable is the same distance and voltage as the proposed NI section of the North/South interconnector.

Case of need

We believe that the reasons presented by SONI to highlight the supposed vital need for the proposed overhead cross border high voltage interconnector do not align with the priorities for Northern Ireland in 2023, and furthermore we believe the consumers of Northern Ireland have been <u>misled</u> on the need for the North-South Interconnector.

In 2016 SONI said, "As the system operator, unless action is taken we won't be confident we can keep the lights on in 2021." Every Security of Supply study issued by SONI / Eirgrid over the last number of years has confirmed that Northern Ireland has a surplus of electricity until 2031 and no forecasts exist beyond 2031, the position of the Republic of Ireland is quite the opposite. Every Security of Supply study issued over the past number of years clearly states that the Republic of Ireland will suffer from a severe electricity deficit for at least the next 7-10 years, with a major risk to supply being caused by energy commitments to data centres in the Republic.

Eirgrid's forecast is a major miscalculation of the generating needs in the Republic of Ireland. They also do not seem to understand the current and future needs of the approximately one hundred Dublin based data centres which they had committed to



supply energy to between 2020 & 2030. This resulted in a major increase in the amount of fossil fuel generated electricity (coal, gas and oil).

SEAT believes that the case of need for the North-South Interconnector has radically changed since it was first proposed, and that this has not been fully considered by SONI or by Northern Ireland's decision makers.

Cost

In these times of a high cost of living, every effort should be made to ensure that Northern Irish consumers are getting the best value possible when it comes to energy costs. The proposed North-South Interconnector has never been fully costed. With no guaranteed costs for this project, SEAT believes that consumers in Northern Ireland should not be expected to foot the bill for expensive infrastructure that will pose no benefit to the people of Northern Ireland.

Even if we were to be assured by Eirgrid that they would fund the proposed interconnector, it is very clear that Eirgrid resources are inadequate to meet the massive transmission requirements of the Republic of Ireland over the next seven to ten years. Recently Eirgrid/SONI stated 2012 costs of €220m, yet the Irish Institute of Engineers estimated the current cost at €830m.

Renewable energy generation in ROI today is 37% below 2019 output. There have been numerous forecasts mentioning a likelihood of energy shortages and volatile pricing for energy consumers over the next seven to ten years. Eirgrid will have no opportunity to transmit any energy to NI for many years to come. Why, going forward, would we agree to increase our interconnection with the ROI, when we would be exposed to volatile fossil fuel generated electricity at much higher prices.

Technology

The proposed Interconnector is a 400 kV overhead line that will connect the Northern Ireland and Republic of Ireland electricity grids. The planning application for this interconnector was submitted in 2009, in the sixteen years since, technology has radically changed and improved across the world. Currently National Grid (Great Britain) and Energinet (Denmark) are constructing the Viking Link, an interconnector between the United Kingdom and Denmark. The Viking Link will be the world's longest electricity interconnector, measuring 765km, and will be an undersea cable. When technology exists that allows interconnectors of this calibre to exist in Lincolnshire, why are the residents of Armagh and Tyrone being treated as second class citizens and being subjected to an unwanted overhead interconnector? The proposed Interconnector as it stands cannot be considered as innovative when it is clear that less obtrusive and much more environmentally friendly technology exists and is used elsewhere.

Conclusion

As you may be aware, the NI regulator concluded that SONI's ownership by Eirgrid since 2009 was contrary to the good operation of SONI going forward. As a result of the push back of Eirgrid's self-serving policy, which was detrimental to the future of renewable growth, Eirgrid have announced that they will demerge their management of SONI. A task force is currently drawing up plans for the eventual outcome. Meanwhile the first members of a new team of directors to run SONI as a standalone transmission operator have been appointed.



The criteria for re-election to the board are-

- 1. Each member must be approved by Northern Ireland regulator
- 2. Applicants employed by Eirgrid or SONI during the last five years or who had professional involvement with Eirgrid or SONI are ineligible.

A 21 day notice was issued to the landowner who refused to sign easement or right of way through their property. SONI subsequently threatened to have them appear before a tribunal with the intention to make Purchase of the required property. This threat failed to change the opinion of the vast majority of landowners. One affected landowner is challenging the legality of the tribunal notice on three different legal grounds. No clear response has yet been issued by SONI/Eirgrid.

Safe Electricity Armagh Tyrone believes:

- This project will offer no benefit to Northern Ireland electricity consumers over the next seven to ten years, and;
- No forecasts have ever been provided to indicate that the project will <u>ever</u> benefit Northern Irish consumers, also:
- The proposed Interconnector as it stands will greatly inconvenience and disadvantage those who live along the route.

SEAT will continue to represent the wishes of our members for as long as it takes to convince decision makers in Northern Ireland that the North-South Interconnector in its present form is not appropriate or necessary. We continue to represent these landowners whilst they have been in receipt of threatening letters from SONI regarding access to lands on the proposed North-South Interconnector route.

As elected representatives representing the people of Tyrone who will be impacted if this infrastructure goes ahead, we urge you to <u>seek a review of the planning approval and of the need for the North-South Interconnector</u>. With the current cost-of-living crisis, we believe a <u>review into the need</u> for this infrastructure is more important than ever.

All of the recent data available states that currently in excess of 50% of electricity generated in Northern Ireland is from renewable sources. The most serious blockage to renewable energy growth in NI is Eirgrid/SONI's failure to invest in adequate transmission infrastructure over the last ten years.

We are happy to provide any further information you may require.

John Woods, Jim Lennon

Safe Electricity Armagh & Tyrone (SEAT)

Mid Ulster District Council Environment Committee meeting Tuesday 14/11/23

1. Eirgrid offers ROI landowners €100,000 for each pylon

2.

- A) Head of the Department for the Economy, Richard Rodgers, states that it is crucial that we in NI are self-sufficient in affordable renewable energy.
- B) If we don't convert all the excess renewable energy produced in NI into green hydrogen the lights will go out when we reach 80% renewable generation.
- C) Ballylumford 'Power to x' project- will use renewable electricity and invest in energy storage, both battery and green hydrogen.
- **3.** Plans are progressing for a €500m green hydrogen storage facility at Kinsale Head gas field, County Cork.
- **4.** The NI Electricity Order 1992. All new distribution investment must be efficient and commercial. The N/S interconnector is neither efficient nor a viable commercial project.
- **5.** NI Climate change act 2022 prohibits trading energy with any country which does not have equivalent greenhouse gas emissions targets matching Northern Ireland. ROI is on a diverging path from NI and is currently increasing fossil fuel generation capacity.

6. The NI Utility Regulator

Mission statement: to protect the short and long term interests of consumers of electricity, water and gas.

Vision: to ensure value and sustainability of energy and water

Values: to be transparent, consistent, proportionate, accountable and targeted. To be professional, listening, explaining and acting with integrity.

The N/S interconnector meets none of these criteria.

7. SEM (Single Electricity Market)

The memorandum of understanding between the NI regulator and ROI regulator.

- A) Quote "We seek to achieve even better value for money for consumers in all we do and all we regulate."
- B) We will set realistic and achievable outcomes which are mutually beneficial to consumers both North and South.
- C) We will facilitate effective and mutually beneficial cooperation.

The N/S interconnector fails to meet any of these above values.

The Single Electricity Market has failed and must be suspended.

- **8.** A new £700m electricity link (two 320v undersea cables) from Kilmarnock to Kilroot is planned, also the Moyle interconnector can provide 400MW capacity if needed.
- **9.** The stinging criticism by the NI Utility Regulator that SONI must be completely separate from Eirgrid, both managerially and operationally. This is because of Eirgrid's self-serving management and governance which conflicted with NI transmission and consumer needs.
- 10. The ESRI (Economic and Social research institute) report released in DEC 22 titled *All-island coordination of energy infrastructure and renewable energy supports* states "we have found that by sharing policy targets on the island of Ireland that the impact would be relatively modest, changing total costs by less than 1%" "The magnitude of the effort would be negligible"

- 11. Quoting from The Anglo Celt newspaper 12/5/22, Mark Foley, Chief Executive of Eirgrid stated that "his belief was that the lights would go out in as little as two years in Ireland, if we have not completed the construction of the N/S interconnector" (Quote from meeting of Cavan County Council monthly meeting).
- 12. "Heads must roll", "industry experts in Ireland argue the energy crisis was of their own making." Concerns were flagged as early as 2014 over the need to bring new power generation online to meet energy demands. Eirgrid in 2015 forecast that there was sufficient generation capacity to meet peak energy demand for the next decade. Just one illustration of Eirgrid's lack of credibility in energy forecasting for both Ireland and Northern Ireland.
- **13.** A SONI publication which featured in *Ambition* magazine (issue 55 Nov-Dec 22) (Article included next to photo of Alan Campbell, Managing Director of SONI) states that "The NI grid will need huge change through to 2030" but also confirming that "SONI is forecasting that a surplus of energy generation in NI will exist until 2031."

Only 30MW of additional renewable capacity was added in NI in 2022 compared to 400MW annually in the period leading to peak development in 2016 (Carson McDowell in Recyclable energy magazine).

14. Security of Supply scenarios Northern Ireland 20/21 to 29/30 surplus availability.